



TABULATION OF BIDS
CITY OF ST. CLAIR SHORES
GOLF COURSE PARKING
LOT RECONSTRUCTION
AEW PROJECT NO. 0150-0574

DATE: 8/16/2022
TIME: 10:30 AM

Prepared by Anderson, Eckstein and Westrick, Inc.
51301 Schoenherr Road
Shelby Township, MI 48315

BIDDER RANKING

| RANK | BIDDER'S NAME | TOTAL BID | ALTERNATE BID |
|------|---------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| 1 | M. L. Chartier Excavating, Inc. | \$ 1,035,149.90 | \$ 703,681.70 |
| 2 | Asphalt Specialists, LLC | \$ 1,170,208.00 | \$ 948,750.00 |
| 3 | Best Asphalt, Inc. | \$ 1,196,237.50 * | \$ 883,325.00 |
| 4 | James P Contracting, Inc. | \$ 1,261,556.75 | \$ 830,565.00 |

* CORRECTED BY ENGINEER



TABULATION OF BIDS
 CITY OF ST. CLAIR SHORES
 GOLF COURSE PARKING
 LOT RECONSTRUCTION
 AEW PROJECT NO. 0150-0574

M. L. Chartier Excavating, Inc.
 9195 Marine City Highway
 Fair Haven, MI 48023

Asphalt Specialists, LLC
 1780 E. Highland
 Pontiac, MI 48340

| Item No. | Description | Estimated Quantity | Units | Unit Price | Amount | Unit Price | Amount |
|----------|--|--------------------|-------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| 1. | _Mobilization, Max 3% | 1 | LS | 31,040.00 | 31,040.00 | 33,000.00 | 33,000.00 |
| 2. | _Site Restoration and Cleanup | 1 | LS | 22,099.90 | 22,099.90 | 35,000.00 | 35,000.00 |
| 3. | _Traffic Control and Maintenance | 1 | LS | 33,780.00 | 33,780.00 | 53,000.00 | 53,000.00 |
| 4. | _Soil Erosion & Sedimentation Control Permit | 1 | LS | 1,000.00 | 1,000.00 | 400.00 | 400.00 |
| 5. | _Fence, Rem, Salvage & Replace | 1 | LS | 9,429.00 | 9,429.00 | 11,000.00 | 11,000.00 |
| 6. | _Landscape, Rem | 1 | LS | 12,432.00 | 12,432.00 | 2,000.00 | 2,000.00 |
| 7. | _Dumpster Wall, Rem, Salv, Replace | 1 | LS | 10,819.00 | 10,819.00 | 4,000.00 | 4,000.00 |
| 8. | _Permanent Signing & Pavt Mrkgs | 1 | LS | 24,750.00 | 24,750.00 | 5,000.00 | 5,000.00 |
| 9. | Tree, Rem, 6 inch to 18 inch | 4 | Ea | 304.00 | 1,216.00 | 1,000.00 | 4,000.00 |
| 10. | _Canopy, Rem, Salv, Replace | 2 | Ea | 2,732.70 | 5,465.40 | 9,000.00 | 18,000.00 |
| 11. | _Pavt, Rem, Modified | 12,750 | Syd | 10.60 | 135,150.00 | 14.00 | 178,500.00 |
| 12. | Sidewalk, Rem | 300 | Syd | 10.00 | 3,000.00 | 13.00 | 3,900.00 |
| 13. | _Sign, Rem | 11 | Ea | 61.30 | 674.30 | 200.00 | 2,200.00 |
| 14. | Dr Structure, Rem | 5 | Ea | 375.80 | 1,879.00 | 1,600.00 | 8,000.00 |
| 15. | _Sewer Bulkhead, 12 inch | 1 | Ea | 797.10 | 797.10 | 800.00 | 800.00 |
| 16. | Sewer, Rem, Less than 24 inch | 325 | Ft | 24.90 | 8,092.50 | 40.00 | 13,000.00 |
| 17. | Underdrain, Subgrade, Open-Graded, 6 inch | 600 | Ft | 19.20 | 11,520.00 | 29.00 | 17,400.00 |
| 18. | Sewer, CI IV, 12 inch, Tr Det B | 350 | Ft | 74.60 | 26,110.00 | 140.00 | 49,000.00 |
| 19. | _Dr Structure, 48 inch dia | 5 | Ea | 3,185.80 | 15,929.00 | 4,500.00 | 22,500.00 |
| 20. | _Dr Structure, 48 inch dia, Modified | 1 | Ea | 3,940.40 | 3,940.40 | 6,000.00 | 6,000.00 |
| 21. | Dr Structure, Tap, 12 inch | 1 | Ea | 352.90 | 352.90 | 1,300.00 | 1,300.00 |
| 22. | Dr Structure Cover, Adj, Case 1 | 3 | Ea | 882.40 | 2,647.20 | 1,100.00 | 3,300.00 |



TABULATION OF BIDS
 CITY OF ST. CLAIR SHORES
 GOLF COURSE PARKING
 LOT RECONSTRUCTION
 AEW PROJECT NO. 0150-0574

M. L. Chartier Excavating, Inc.
 9195 Marine City Highway
 Fair Haven, MI 48023

Asphalt Specialists, LLC
 1780 E. Highland
 Pontiac, MI 48340

| Item No. | Description | Estimated Quantity | Units | Unit Price | Amount | Unit Price | Amount |
|----------|--|--------------------|-------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| 23. | _Gate Well Cover, Adj, Case 1 | 1 | Ea | 882.40 | 882.40 | 1,600.00 | 1,600.00 |
| 24. | _Sanitary Cover, Adj, Case 1 | 1 | Ea | 882.40 | 882.40 | 1,600.00 | 1,600.00 |
| 25. | _Utility Cover, Adj, Case 1 | 1 | Ea | 510.30 | 510.30 | 1,600.00 | 1,600.00 |
| 26. | _Dr Structure Cover, Catch Basin | 3 | Ea | 1,297.80 | 3,893.40 | 800.00 | 2,400.00 |
| 27. | _Dr Structure Cover, Storm Manhole | 1 | Ea | 605.00 | 605.00 | 900.00 | 900.00 |
| 28. | Conduit, Schedule 40, 2 inch | 175 | Ft | 16.80 | 2,940.00 | 35.00 | 6,125.00 |
| 29. | _Bollard, 8 inch | 4 | Ea | 1,397.00 | 5,588.00 | 1,800.00 | 7,200.00 |
| 30. | HMA, 4EML | 1,500 | Ton | 121.30 | 181,950.00 | 125.00 | 187,500.00 |
| 31. | HMA, 5EML | 825 | Ton | 146.50 | 120,862.50 | 150.00 | 123,750.00 |
| 32. | Aggregate Base, 6 inch | 600 | Syd | 11.80 | 7,080.00 | 11.00 | 6,600.00 |
| 33. | Aggregate Base, 8 inch | 11,750 | Syd | 15.30 | 179,775.00 | 14.00 | 164,500.00 |
| 34. | Aggregate Base, 10 inch | 120 | Syd | 26.20 | 3,144.00 | 16.00 | 1,920.00 |
| 35. | Curb and Gutter, Conc, Det D2 | 130 | Ft | 35.00 | 4,550.00 | 40.00 | 5,200.00 |
| 36. | _Curb and Gutter, Conc, Det D2, Modified | 1,750 | Ft | 35.00 | 61,250.00 | 40.00 | 70,000.00 |
| 37. | Curb and Gutter, Conc, Det F4 | 300 | Ft | 35.00 | 10,500.00 | 40.00 | 12,000.00 |
| 38. | Sidewalk, Conc, 4 inch | 1,225 | Sft | 7.50 | 9,187.50 | 7.00 | 8,575.00 |
| 39. | Curb Ramp, Conc, 4 inch | 140 | Sft | 12.40 | 1,736.00 | 9.00 | 1,260.00 |
| 40. | _Sidewalk, Conc, 4 inch with Curb Face | 400 | Sft | 17.20 | 6,880.00 | 13.00 | 5,200.00 |
| 41. | Conc Pavt, Misc, Nonreinf, 8 inch | 90 | Syd | 85.00 | 7,650.00 | 105.00 | 9,450.00 |
| 42. | Conc Pavt, Nonreinf, 6 inch | 550 | Syd | 55.00 | 30,250.00 | 65.00 | 35,750.00 |
| 43. | Conc Pavt, Nonreinf, 8 inch | 120 | Syd | 75.00 | 9,000.00 | 115.00 | 13,800.00 |
| 44. | Driveway, Nonreinf Conc, 6 inch | 37 | Syd | 65.00 | 2,405.00 | 134.00 | 4,958.00 |



TABULATION OF BIDS
 CITY OF ST. CLAIR SHORES
 GOLF COURSE PARKING
 LOT RECONSTRUCTION
 AEW PROJECT NO. 0150-0574

M. L. Chartier Excavating, Inc.
 9195 Marine City Highway
 Fair Haven, MI 48023

Asphalt Specialists, LLC
 1780 E. Highland
 Pontiac, MI 48340

| Item No. | Description | Estimated Quantity | Units | Unit Price | Amount | Unit Price | Amount |
|----------------------------|---|--------------------|-------|------------|---------------------|------------|---------------------|
| 45. | Erosion Control, Inlet Protection, Fabric Drop | 12 | Ea | 116.10 | 1,393.20 | 185.00 | 2,220.00 |
| 46. | _Inlet Filter, Sedcage | 1 | Ea | 254.10 | 254.10 | 330.00 | 330.00 |
| 47. | Erosion Control, Gravel Access Approach | 2 | Ea | 1,899.20 | 3,798.40 | 1,100.00 | 2,200.00 |
| 48. | Erosion Control, Silt Fence | 1,120 | Ft | 3.20 | 3,584.00 | 2.25 | 2,520.00 |
| 49. | Mulch, 3 inch | 1,250 | Syd | 8.30 | 10,375.00 | 11.00 | 13,750.00 |
| 50. | Subgrade Undercutting, Type II | 50 | Cyd | 42.00 | 2,100.00 | 120.00 | 6,000.00 |
| TOTAL AMOUNT BID | | | | \$ | 1,035,149.90 | \$ | 1,170,208.00 |
| ALTERNATE BID | | | | | | | |
| 1. | Golf Cart Parking Area | 1 | LS | 25,656.70 | 25,656.70 | 33,000.00 | 33,000.00 |
| 2. | Conc. Pavt. With Integral Curb, Nonreinf., 6 inch | 9,250 | Syd | 57.00 | 527,250.00 | 85.00 | 786,250.00 |
| 3. | Aggregate Base, 8 inch | 9,250 | Syd | 16.30 | 150,775.00 | 14.00 | 129,500.00 |
| TOTAL ALTERNATE BID | | | | \$ | 703,681.70 | \$ | 948,750.00 |

* CORRECTED BY ENGINEER

¹ Addition Error



TABULATION OF BIDS
 CITY OF ST. CLAIR SHORES
 GOLF COURSE PARKING
 LOT RECONSTRUCTION
 AEW PROJECT NO. 0150-0574

Best Asphalt , Inc.
 6334 N. Beverly Plaza
 Romulus, MI 48174

James P Contracting, Inc.
 67222 Van Dyke
 Washington, MI 48095

| Item No. | Description | Estimated Quantity | Units | Unit Price | Amount | Unit Price | Amount |
|----------|--|--------------------|-------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| 1. | _Mobilization, Max 3% | 1 | LS | 35,000.00 | 35,000.00 | 35,000.00 | 35,000.00 |
| 2. | _Site Restoration and Cleanup | 1 | LS | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 24,000.00 | 24,000.00 |
| 3. | _Traffic Control and Maintenance | 1 | LS | 20,000.00 | 20,000.00 | 53,000.00 | 53,000.00 |
| 4. | _Soil Erosion & Sedimentation Control Permit | 1 | LS | 1,500.00 | 1,500.00 | 1,350.00 | 1,350.00 |
| 5. | _Fence, Rem, Salvage & Replace | 1 | LS | 7,500.00 | 7,500.00 | 15,900.00 | 15,900.00 |
| 6. | _Landscape, Rem | 1 | LS | 6,300.00 | 6,300.00 | 5,400.00 | 5,400.00 |
| 7. | _Dumpster Wall, Rem, Salv, Replace | 1 | LS | 7,500.00 | 7,500.00 | 17,170.00 | 17,170.00 |
| 8. | _Permanent Signing & Pavt Mrkgs | 1 | LS | 5,400.00 | 5,400.00 | 13,500.00 | 13,500.00 |
| 9. | Tree, Rem, 6 inch to 18 inch | 4 | Ea | 800.00 | 3,200.00 | 865.00 | 3,460.00 |
| 10. | _Canopy, Rem, Salv, Replace | 2 | Ea | 2,500.00 | 5,000.00 | 3,350.00 | 6,700.00 |
| 11. | _Pavt, Rem, Modified | 12,750 | Syd | 17.60 | 224,400.00 | 17.80 | 226,950.00 |
| 12. | Sidewalk, Rem | 300 | Syd | 19.00 | 5,700.00 | 16.35 | 4,905.00 |
| 13. | _Sign, Rem | 11 | Ea | 150.00 | 1,650.00 | 125.00 | 1,375.00 |
| 14. | Dr Structure, Rem | 5 | Ea | 1,000.00 | 5,000.00 | 810.00 | 4,050.00 |
| 15. | _Sewer Bulkhead, 12 inch | 1 | Ea | 750.00 | 750.00 | 1,080.00 | 1,080.00 |
| 16. | Sewer, Rem, Less than 24 inch | 325 | Ft | 20.00 | 6,500.00 | 20.00 | 6,500.00 |
| 17. | Underdrain, Subgrade, Open-Graded, 6 inch | 600 | Ft | 25.00 | 15,000.00 | 30.00 | 18,000.00 |
| 18. | Sewer, CI IV, 12 inch, Tr Det B | 350 | Ft | 125.00 | 43,750.00 | 120.00 | 42,000.00 |
| 19. | _Dr Structure, 48 inch dia | 5 | Ea | 5,500.00 | 27,500.00 | 9,000.00 | 45,000.00 |
| 20. | _Dr Structure, 48 inch dia, Modified | 1 | Ea | 7,500.00 | 7,500.00 | 11,000.00 | 11,000.00 |
| 21. | Dr Structure, Tap, 12 inch | 1 | Ea | 1,000.00 | 1,000.00 | 1,080.00 | 1,080.00 |
| 22. | Dr Structure Cover, Adj, Case 1 | 3 | Ea | 650.00 | 1,950.00 | 1,080.00 | 3,240.00 |



TABULATION OF BIDS
 CITY OF ST. CLAIR SHORES
 GOLF COURSE PARKING
 LOT RECONSTRUCTION
 AEW PROJECT NO. 0150-0574

Best Asphalt , Inc.
 6334 N. Beverly Plaza
 Romulus, MI 48174

James P Contracting, Inc.
 67222 Van Dyke
 Washington, MI 48095

| Item No. | Description | Estimated Quantity | Units | Unit Price | Amount | Unit Price | Amount |
|----------|--|--------------------|-------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| 23. | _Gate Well Cover, Adj, Case 1 | 1 | Ea | 650.00 | 650.00 | 1,080.00 | 1,080.00 |
| 24. | _Sanitary Cover, Adj, Case 1 | 1 | Ea | 650.00 | 650.00 | 1,300.00 | 1,300.00 |
| 25. | _Utility Cover, Adj, Case 1 | 1 | Ea | 650.00 | 650.00 | 1,300.00 | 1,300.00 |
| 26. | _Dr Structure Cover, Catch Basin | 3 | Ea | 850.00 | 2,550.00 | 810.00 | 2,430.00 |
| 27. | _Dr Structure Cover, Storm Manhole | 1 | Ea | 850.00 | 850.00 | 810.00 | 810.00 |
| 28. | Conduit, Schedule 40, 2 inch | 175 | Ft | 12.00 | 2,100.00 | 27.00 | 4,725.00 |
| 29. | _Bollard, 8 inch | 4 | Ea | 900.00 | 3,600.00 | 1,000.00 | 4,000.00 |
| 30. | HMA, 4EML | 1,500 | Ton | 145.00 | 217,500.00 | 126.50 | 189,750.00 |
| 31. | HMA, 5EML | 825 | Ton | 168.00 | 138,600.00 | 143.75 | 118,593.75 |
| 32. | Aggregate Base, 6 inch | 600 | Syd | 14.00 | 8,400.00 | 13.70 | 8,220.00 |
| 33. | Aggregate Base, 8 inch | 11,750 | Syd | 16.50 | 193,875.00 | 16.70 | 196,225.00 |
| 34. | Aggregate Base, 10 inch | 120 | Syd | 18.90 | 2,268.00 | 23.30 | 2,796.00 |
| 35. | Curb and Gutter, Conc, Det D2 | 130 | Ft | 38.00 | 4,940.00 | 37.80 | 4,914.00 |
| 36. | _Curb and Gutter, Conc, Det D2, Modified | 1,750 | Ft | 38.00 | 66,500.00 | 37.80 | 66,150.00 |
| 37. | Curb and Gutter, Conc, Det F4 | 300 | Ft | 38.00 | 11,400.00 | 37.80 | 11,340.00 |
| 38. | Sidewalk, Conc, 4 inch | 1,225 | Sft | 6.50 | 7,962.50 | 8.60 | 10,535.00 |
| 39. | Curb Ramp, Conc, 4 inch | 140 | Sft | 11.00 | 1,540.00 | 12.90 | 1,806.00 |
| 40. | _Sidewalk, Conc, 4 inch with Curb Face | 400 | Sft | 16.50 | 6,600.00 | 18.40 | 7,360.00 |
| 41. | Conc Pavt, Misc, Nonreinf, 8 inch | 90 | Syd | 93.00 | 8,370.00 | 92.00 | 8,280.00 |
| 42. | Conc Pavt, Nonreinf, 6 inch | 550 | Syd | 60.00 | 33,000.00 | 59.40 | 32,670.00 |
| 43. | Conc Pavt, Nonreinf, 8 inch | 120 | Syd | 82.00 | 9,840.00 | 81.00 | 9,720.00 |
| 44. | Driveway, Nonreinf Conc, 6 inch | 37 | Syd | 71.00 | 2,627.00 | 70.00 | 2,590.00 |



TABULATION OF BIDS
 CITY OF ST. CLAIR SHORES
 GOLF COURSE PARKING
 LOT RECONSTRUCTION
 AEW PROJECT NO. 0150-0574

Best Asphalt , Inc.
 6334 N. Beverly Plaza
 Romulus, MI 48174

James P Contracting, Inc.
 67222 Van Dyke
 Washington, MI 48095

| Item No. | Description | Estimated Quantity | Units | Unit Price | Amount | Unit Price | Amount |
|----------------------------|---|--------------------|-------|------------|---------------------|------------|------------------------|
| 45. | Erosion Control, Inlet Protection, Fabric Drop | 12 | Ea | 100.00 | 1,200.00 | 175.00 | 2,100.00 |
| 46. | _Inlet Filter, Sedcage | 1 | Ea | 125.00 | 125.00 | 350.00 | 350.00 |
| 47. | Erosion Control, Gravel Access Approach | 2 | Ea | 2,000.00 | 4,000.00 | 3,350.00 | 6,700.00 |
| 48. | Erosion Control, Silt Fence | 1,120 | Ft | 2.00 | 2,240.00 | 4.60 | 5,152.00 |
| 49. | Mulch, 3 inch | 1,250 | Syd | 14.00 | 17,500.00 | 12.00 | 15,000.00 |
| 50. | Subgrade Undercutting, Type II | 50 | Cyd | 92.00 | 4,600.00 | 100.00 | 5,000.00 |
| TOTAL AMOUNT BID | | | | \$ | 1,196,237.50 | *1 | \$ 1,261,556.75 |
| ALTERNATE BID | | | | | | | |
| 1. | Golf Cart Parking Area | 1 | LS | 98,000.00 | 98,000.00 | 42,465.00 | 42,465.00 |
| 2. | Conc. Pavt. With Integral Curb, Nonreinf., 6 inch | 9,250 | Syd | 68.40 | 632,700.00 | 68.50 | 633,625.00 |
| 3. | Aggregate Base, 8 inch | 9,250 | Syd | 16.50 | 152,625.00 | 16.70 | 154,475.00 |
| TOTAL ALTERNATE BID | | | | \$ | 883,325.00 | \$ | 830,565.00 |

* CORRECTED BY ENGINEER

¹ Addition Error